

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
FACULTY of LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY  
3 1761 09564142 9

# Constitutional Law “B” Professor L. Weinrib

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto  
2013-2014

Volume III

STORAGE

KE  
4218.5  
.W45  
2013  
v.3  
c.1





UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO  
FACULTY OF LAW

**Constitutional Law “B”  
Professor L. Weinrib**

**Faculty of Law, University of Toronto  
2013-2014**

**Volume III**



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/constitutionalla03wein\\_2](https://archive.org/details/constitutionalla03wein_2)

# CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW: PRECHARTER

## L WEINRIB VOL I (2013-2014)

### CHAPTER 1: KEY CONCEPTS AND INSTITUTIONS

(Univ of Alberta, Centre for Constitutional Studies, Keywords) .....	1
Constitutionalism.....	1
Constitution Acts .....	1
Rule of Law .....	2
Supremacy of Parliament.....	3
Convention .....	3
Division of [Legislative] Powers [between federal and provincial governments].....	4
Constitutional Rights.....	5
Judicial Review.....	6
Aboriginal Self-Government .....	8
Judicial Committee of the Privy Council .....	8
Supreme Court of Canada.....	9

#### ON BLACKBOARD:

Louis Henkin, "Elements of Constitutionalism"

### CHAPTER 2: INTRODUCTION TO CANADA'S CONSTITUTION

Re: <i>Resolution to amend the Constitution</i> , [1981] 1 S.C.R. 753 ("the Patriation Reference") .....	10
Reference re: <i>Secession of Québec</i> , [1998] 2 S.C.R. 217 ("the Secession Reference").....	18
Ref. re: <i>Remuneration of Judges of the Provincial Court of Prince Edward Island</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 3 ("the Judges Remuneration Reference").....	30

### CHAPTER 3: THE QUASI-COLONIAL PERIOD

#### A. "The Race Cases"

James W. St. G. Walker, "Quong v. The King" .....	33
<i>Union Colliery Company of British Columbia v. Bryden</i> , [1899] A.C. 580.....	54
<i>Cunningham and AG BC v. Tomey Homma and Attorney-General Canada</i> , [1903] A.C. 151 .....	56
<i>Quong Wing v. The King</i> , [1914] 49 S.C.R. 440 .....	57
Ian Bushnell, "Reference Re Deportation of Japanese, 1946".....	60
Frank Scott, "The Deportation of the Japanese Canadians: An Open Letter to The Press" .....	64

#### ON BLACKBOARD:

James W. St. G. Walker, "Quong Wing and Quong Sing"

#### B. Economic Regulation

<i>The King v. Eastern Terminal Elevator Co.</i> , [1925] S.C.R. 434.....	66
Vincent MacDonald, "The Privy Council and the Canadian Constitution, [1951] 29 Can. Bar Rev. 1021 at 1124 ff .....	70

### CHAPTER 4: MOVING TOWARDS POLITICAL AND CONSTITUTIONAL INDEPENDENCE: EARLY READINGS OF THE B.N.A. ACT AS A CONSTITUTION

#### A. Women in Public Life

Reference re Meaning of the Word "Persons" in s. 24 of the B.N.A. Act, [1928] S.C.R. 276 ("the Persons Case") .....	75
<i>Lord Brougham's Act, 1850</i> ("An Act for shortening the language...) .....	79
<i>Edwards et al. v. Attorney-General for Canada et al.</i> , [1930] A.C. 124 ("the Persons Case") .....	80

#### B. The Treaty Making Power

<i>In re the Regulation and Control of Aeronautics in Canada</i> , [1932] A.C. 54 .....	84
<i>In re Regulation and Control of Radio Communications in Canada</i> , [1932] A.C. 304 .....	88
Reference re Weekly Rest in Industrial Undertakings Act, Minimum Wages Act and Limitations of Hours Act, [1937] 1 D.L.R. 673.....	90

## C. Interpreting a Written Constitution

Bushnell, "The Privy Council and Mr. Bennett's New Deal Legislation" .....	92
A.G. Ontario v. A.G. Canada, [1947] A.C. 127 ("the Supreme Court Act Reference") .....	98

## CHAPTER 5: "INDIANS AND LANDS RESERVED TO THE INDIANS" (PRE 1982)

The Royal Proclamation of 1763 (excerpt).....	101
Constitution Act, 1867 (U.K.), 30 & 31 Vict., c. 3, s. 91(24).....	102
Report of The Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples (1996) (excerpt) .....	103
Fleras and Elliott, "The Department of Indian Affairs: From Bureaucracy to Empowerment?" .....	110
Guerin v. The Queen, [1984] 2 SCR 335.....	113

## ON BLACKBOARD:

Ryder, "The Demise and Rise of the Classical Paradigm in Canadian Federalism"	
---	--

## CHAPTER 6: TRANSITION TO POST-WWII RIGHTS PROTECTION

### A. The Implied Bill of Rights: Adjudicating the Template of Liberal Democracy

Bushnell, "The Implied Bill of Rights".....	116
Sandra Djwa, <i>The Politics of the Imagination: A Life of F.R. Scott</i> .....	119
Ian Bushnell, Note on Alberta Statutes Reference .....	125
Reference re Alberta Statutes, [1938] S.C.R.100.....	127
Roncarelli v. Duplessis, [1959] S.C.R. 121 .....	129
Winner v. S.M.T. (Eastern) Ltd., [1951] S.C.R.887 .....	136
Saumur v. City of Quebec and Attorney-General of Quebec, [1953] 4 D.L.R. 641 .....	138
Switzman v. Elbling and Attorney-General of Quebec, [1957] 7 D.L.R. (2d) 337 .....	142
Attorney-General (Canada) and Dupond v. Montreal, [1978] 2 S.C.R. 770 .....	147

### B. The Canadian Bill of Rights: Legislative Supremacy and Rights Protection

Bushnell, "The Canadian Bill of Rights" .....	149
James G. Snell and Frederick Vaughan, <i>The Supreme Court of Canada: History of the Institution</i> (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985) at 218ff .....	151
<i>The Canadian Bill of Rights</i> , S.C. 1960, c. 44 .....	155
<i>The Queen v. Drybones</i> , [1970] S.C.R. 282 .....	156
Attorney-General of Canada v. Lavell—Isaac v. Bedard, [1974] S.C.R. 1349 .....	159
Bliss v. Attorney-General of Canada, [1979] 1 S.C.R. 183.....	165

## CHAPTER 7: INTRODUCTION TO THE CHARTER

### A. The Adoption of the Charter

A. Cairns, <i>Charter Versus Federalism</i> .....	168
P. Russell, "The Political Purposes of the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms" .....	171
L. Weinrib, "Canada's Constitutional Revolution: From Legislative to Constitutional State" .....	174
L. Weinrib, "Canada's Charter of Rights: Paradigm Lost?" .....	178
L. Weinrib, "The Charter Critics: Strangers in a Strange Land" .....	195

### B. The Legal Framework of the Charter: Rights, Limits & Override

#### i. Reading the Charter: Purposive Interpretation

<i>Hunter v. Southam</i> , [1984] 2 S.C.R. 145 .....	201
<i>Minister of Home Affairs v. Fisher</i> , [1980] A.C. 319 (P.C.) .....	205
<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</i> , [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 .....	207

#### ii. Justified Limits on Rights

<i>R. v. Oakes</i> [1986] 1 S.C.R. 103 .....	210
--	-----

#### iii. Legislative Override

Lorraine E. Weinrib, "Learning to Live With the Override" .....	213
Lorraine E. Weinrib, "The Notwithstanding Clause: The Loophole Cementing the Charter" .....	236
"Alberta Adopts 'Notwithstanding' Referendum Act" .....	243

#### iv. Siracusa Principles, 1984 (Limitation and Derogation of Rights)

Siracusa Principles, 1984 (Limitation and Derogation of Rights) .....	244
---	-----

# CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW: THE CHARTER L WEINRIB VOL II (2013-2014)

## CHAPTER 8: DEMOCRATIC RIGHTS (CHARTER S.3-5)

Reference <i>Re Provincial Electoral Boundaries</i> (Sask.) [1991] 2 S.C.R. 158 .....	1
<i>Sauvé v. Canada (Chief Electoral Officer)</i> , [1993] 2 S.C.R. 438 .....	7
Notes: <i>Figueroa v. Canada</i> , [2003] 1 S.C.R. 912 .....	33

## CHAPTER 9: FREEDOM OF CONSCIENCE AND RELIGION (CHARTER S.2(A))

### A. Introduction

Case extracts:

<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</i> , [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 .....	40
<i>Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem</i> , [2004] 2 S.C.R. 551 .....	41
Note: Freedom of Conscience .....	42

### ON BLACKBOARD:

L Weinrib "Do Justice to Us"

### B. The Demise of the Informal Christian Establishment

#### i. Public Policy

L Weinrib, "Do Justice to Us!" Jews and the Constitution of Canada .....	44
<i>R. v. Big M Drug Mart</i> , [1985] 1 S.C.R. 295 .....	50
Note: <i>Edwards Books</i> , [1986] 2 S.C.R. 713 .....	57
L Weinrib, "Ensuring Equality" .....	59

#### ii. The Public School System Transformed by Charter Recognition of Religious/Moral Diversity

<i>Zylberberg v. Sudbury Board of Education</i> (1988) 52 D.L.R. 577 (Ont.C.A.) .....	61
<i>C.C.L.A. v. Minister of Education</i> (1990) .....	63
Notes:	
<i>Ross v. New Brunswick School District No. 15</i> , [1996] 1 S.C.R. 825 .....	66
<i>Trinity Western Univ v. B. C. College of Teachers</i> (2001) S.C.R. 31 .....	66
<i>Chamberlain v. Surrey School District No. 36</i> [2002] S.C.J. No. 87 .....	67
<i>Kempling v. B. College of Teachers</i> (2005) 255 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 169 .....	68
<i>Multani v. Commission scolaire Marguerite-Bourgeoys</i> [2006] 1 S.C.R. 256 .....	70
<i>S.L. v Commission scolaire des Chênes</i> [2012] S.C.J. No. 7 .....	75

#### iii. The Bifurcated Public School System: Arrangements for Diversity at Confederation

Notes:

Reference <i>Re Bill 30</i> , [1987] 1 S.C.R. 1148 .....	81
<i>Adler v. Ontario</i> , [1996] 3 S.C.R. 609 .....	81
L Weinrib, "Funding for Faith-based Schools?", Law Times July, 2007 .....	83
Note: <i>Hall (Litigation guardian of) v. Powers</i> , (2002) .....	84

### C. Minority Religious Practices

<i>B. (R.) v. Childrens's Aid Society</i> , [1995] 1 S.C.R. 315 (sub nom. Sheena B., Re) .....	85
<i>Alberta v. Hutterian Brethren of Wilson Colony</i> [2009] S.C.J. No. 37 .....	89
<i>Syndicat Northcrest v. Amselem</i> , [2004] 2 S.C.R. 551 .....	114
Note: exemptions from performing same-sex marriages .....	116
<i>Reference re: Section 293 of the Criminal Code of Canada ("the Polygamy Reference")</i> 2011 BCSC 1588 .....	118

## CHAPTER 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION (CHARTER S.2(B))

### A. Introduction

<i>R. v. Keegstra</i> , [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 .....	138
---	-----

Notes:

The European Convention on Human Rights (1950), extract .....	142
---	-----

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (1966), extract.....	143
<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (Attorney General)</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927 .....	144

## **B. Political Expression**

<i>Native Women's Assn. of Canada v. Canada</i> , [1994] 3 S.C.R. 627 .....	146
<i>Thomson Newspapers Co. v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> , [1998] 1 S.C.R. 877 .....	150
<i>Harper v. Canada</i> , [2004] 1 S.C.R. 827, 2004 SCC 33.....	161
Note: <i>Ontario (Attorney General) v. Dieleman</i> , 1994 A.C.W.S.J. LEXIS 76253; 1994 A.C.W.S.J. 404796; 49 A.C.W.S. (3d) 1059 .....	168
<i>R.W.D.S.U., Local 558 v. Pepsi-Cola</i> , 2002 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS 9; 2002 SCC 8 .....	171

## **C. Commercial Speech**

<i>Irwin Toy Ltd. v. Quebec (Attorney General)</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 927 .....	175
<i>RJR - MacDonald Inc. v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> , [1995] 3 S.C.R. 199 .....	184
<i>Canada (Attorney General) v. JTI-Macdonald Corp</i> , [2007], 2 S.C.R. 610.....	199
<i>Ramsden v. Peterborough (City)</i> , 16 C.R.R. (2d) 240; 1993 C.R.R. LEXIS 90 .....	209
<i>R. v. Guignard</i> , 2002 Can. Sup. Ct. LEXIS 17; 2002 SCC 14.....	213

## **D. Hate Speech**

<i>R. v. Keegstra</i> , [1990] 3 S.C.R. 697 .....	216
Note on: <i>R. v. Zundel</i> , [1992] 2 S.C.R. 731 .....	237

## **E. Obscenity and Pornography**

<i>R. v. Butler</i> , [1992] 1 S.C.R. 452.....	239
<i>Little Sisters Book and Art Emporium v. Canada (Minister of Justice)</i> , [2000] 2 S.C.R. 1120 .....	243
<i>R. v. Sharpe</i> , [2001] 1 S.C.R. 45, 2001 SCC 2 .....	247
Note: The Charter Reconstructs the Indecency Standard – <i>R v Labaye</i> ([2005] 3 SCR 728, 2005 SCC 80) and <i>R v Kouri</i> ([2005] 3 SCR 789, 2005 SCC 81) .....	252

## **F. Defamation**

<i>Hill v. Church of Scientology Toronto</i> , [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130.....	253
--	-----

# **CHAPTER 11: RIGHT TO LIFE, LIBERTY, AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON**

## **A. Introduction and Methodology**

Philip W. Augustine, "Protection of the Right to Property" .....	262
<i>Singh v. Canada (Minister Of Employment And Immigration)</i> , [1985] 1 S.C.R.77 .....	265
<i>Re B.C. Motor Vehicle Act (Motor Vehicle Act Reference)</i> , [1985] 2 S.C.R. 486 .....	268

## **B. Life, Liberty, and Security of the Person**

<i>R. v. Morgentaler</i> , [1988] 1 S.C.R. 30 .....	274
<i>Rodriguez v. B.C.A.G.</i> , [1993] 3 S.C.R. 519 .....	288
<i>B. (R.) v. Children's Aid Society</i> , [1995] 1 S.C.R. 315 (sub nom. Sheena B., Re) .....	296
<i>New Brunswick B v. G(J.)</i> , [1999] 3 S.C.R. 46 .....	302
Reference re ss. 193 and 195.1(1)(c) of the Criminal Code ("the Prostitution Reference"), [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1123.....	309
Note: <i>Godbout v. Longueuil</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 844 .....	312
<i>Canada (A.G.) v. PHS Community Services Society</i> , [2011] 3 S.C.R. 134 .....	314

## **C. Socio-Economic Rights**

<i>Gosselin v. Quebec (Attorney General)</i> , [2002] 4 S.C.R. 429, 2002 SCC 84 .....	324
---	-----

**CANADIAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW**  
**L WEINRIB VOL III (2013-2014)**  
**EQUALITY, MODERN FEDERALISM, ABORIGINAL RIGHTS POST 1982**

**CHAPTER 12: EQUALITY**

**A. Introduction**

J Snell and F Vaughan, "The Supreme Court of Canada" .....	1
B.L. Strayer, "In the Beginning: The Origins of s15 of the Charter" .....	8
<i>Law Society of British Columbia v. Andrews</i> [1989] 1 S.C.R. 143 .....	15

**B. Gender**

Note: <i>Symes v. Canada</i> , [1993] 4 SCR 695.....	17
<i>Law v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)</i> [1999] 1 S.C.R. 497 .....	18
<i>Newfoundland (Treasury Board) v. N.A.P.E.</i> [2004] 3 S.C.R. 381 .....	23
<i>Withler v. Canada (Attorney General)</i> [2011] 1 S.C.R. 396 .....	28

**C. Sexual Orientation**

<i>Egan v. Canada</i> [1995] 2 S.C.R. 513.....	36
<i>Vriend v. Alberta</i> [1998] 1 S.C.R. 493 .....	49
<i>M. v. H.</i> [1999] 2 S.C.R. 3.151.....	56
Note: <i>Halpern v. Attorney General of Canada</i> [2003] O.J. No. 2268 .....	71
<i>Reference re Same-Sex Marriage</i> , [2004] 3 S.C.R. 698 .....	72

**D. Disability**

<i>Eldridge v. British Columbia</i> [1997] 3 S.C.R. 624 .....	87
<i>Auton v. British Columbia</i> [2004] 3 S.C.R. 657 .....	94

**E. Analogous Grounds**

Note: <i>Nova Scotia (Attorney General) v. Walsh</i> 2002 SCC 83 .....	101
<i>Corbiere v. Canada</i> [1999] 2 S.C.R. 203.....	103

**F. Affirmative Action and Positive Discrimination**

Note: <i>Lovelace v. Ontario</i> [2001] 1 S.C.R. 950 .....	110
<i>R v. Kapp</i> [2008] SCC 41.....	112
<i>Alberta (Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development) v. Cunningham</i> [2011] 2 S.C.R. 670 .....	115

**CHAPTER 13: FREEDOM OF ASSOCIATION**

Steven Barret, "Dunmore v. Ontario: Freedom of Association at the Crossroads".....	122
Ken Norman, "Freedom of Association".....	140
<i>Dunmore v. Ontario (Attorney General)</i> [2001] 3 S.C.R. 1016.....	159
<i>Health Services and Support. v. British Columbia</i> [2007] 2 S.C.R. 391 .....	170

**CHAPTER 14: MODERN FEDERALISM – READINGS**

Ronald Watts, Comparing Fed'l Systems in the 1990's .....	179
Keith S. Rosen, "Federalism in the Americas in Comparative Perspective".....	183
Barry Strayer, <i>The Canadian Constitution and the Courts: The Function and Scope of Judicial Review</i> , 3 ed. .....	188
Paul Weiler, <i>In the Last Resort</i> (Toronto: Carswell, 1974) at 164 ff.....	191
Garth Stevenson, <i>Unfulfilled Union: Canadian Federalism and National Unity</i> at 45ff .....	192

**CHAPTER 15: MODERN FEDERALISM – SELECTED POWERS (CASES)**

**A. Overview**

<i>Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta</i> , 2007 SCC 22, [2007] 2 S.C.R. 3 .....	202
<i>Reference re Employment Insurance Act (Can.)</i> , ss. 22 and 23, [2005] 2 S.C.R. 669 .....	205

**B. Criminal Law & Property and Civil Rights**

<i>Proprietary Articles Trade Association v. Attorney-General for Canada</i> , [1931] 2 D.L.R. 1 .....	224
<i>Re Validity of Section 5(a) of the Dairy Industry Act (The Margarine Reference)</i>	

[1949] S.C.R. 1 189.....	225
<i>R. v. Morgentaler</i> , [1993] 3 S.C.R. 463 .....	226
<i>Reference re Firearms Act</i> , [2000] 1 S.C.R. 783 .....	233
<i>R. v. Hydro-Québec</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 213 .....	241
Note: <i>Chatterjee v. Ontario (Attorney General)</i> , 2009 SCC 19 .....	246

### **C. Trade and Commerce & Property and Civil Rights**

<i>General Motors v. City National Leasing</i> , [1989] 1 S.C.R. 641 .....	247
Proposal for National Securities Regulator.....	257

### **D. Peace, Order, and Good Government (POGG)**

<i>Bushnell, "Reference re Anti-Inflation Act, 1976"</i> .....	264
<i>Re: Anti-Inflation Act</i> , [1976] 2 S.C.R. 373 .....	268
<i>R. v. Crown Zellerbach Canada Ltd.</i> , [1988] 1 S.C.R. 401 .....	278
Note: <i>Malmo-Levine</i> , [2003] 3 S.C.R. 571 .....	284

### **E. Paramountcy**

<i>Multiple Access Ltd. v. McCutcheon</i> , [1982] 2 S.C.R. 161.....	285
<i>Bank of Montreal v. Hall</i> , [1990] 1 S.C.R. 121 .....	287
<i>Husky Oil Operations Ltd. v. M.N.R.</i> , [1995] 3 SCR 453 .....	290
<i>Rothmans, Benson &amp; Hedges Inc. v. Saskatchewan</i> , [2005] 1 S.C.R. 188, 250 D.L.R. (4 <sup>th</sup> ) 411.....	292
Note: <i>Law Society of British Columbia v. Mangat</i> , [2001] 3 S.C.R. 113.....	295

### **F. Interjurisdictional Immunity**

<i>Canadian Western Bank v. Alberta</i> , 2007 SCC 22, [2007] 2 S.C.R. 3 .....	296
--	-----

## **CHAPTER 16: ABORIGINAL PEOPLES AND THE CONSTITUTION (POST 1982)**

### **A. The Constitutional Entrenchment of Aboriginal Rights**

#### **B. Aboriginal Title**

#### **C. Treaty Rights**

#### **D. The Duty to Consult**

#### **E. Aboriginal Rights of Self-Government**

#### **F. Aboriginal Women's Rights**